

APPLICATION NUMBER		24/00019/FUL	
SITE ADDRESS:		Russets, 2B Wyaston Road, Ashbourne, DE6 1DD	
DESCRIPTION OF DEVELOPMENT		Proposed single and two storey extensions	
CASE OFFICER	G Huffen	APPLICANT	Mr & Mrs Young
PARISH/TOWN	Ashbourne	AGENT	Making Plans Architecture
WARD MEMBER(S)	Cllr R Archer Cllr A Bates Cllr N Wilton	DETERMINATION TARGET	05.03.2024
REASON FOR DETERMINATION BY COMMITTEE	Called in by Ward Member. Level of local objection.	REASON FOR SITE VISIT (IF APPLICABLE)	To enable Members to appreciate the site and context.

MATERIAL PLANNING ISSUES

- Impact on the Character and Appearance of the Area
- Impact on Neighbour's Amenity
- Impact on Trees

RECOMMENDATION

The proposed development, as amended, is considered on balance to be acceptable in terms of design and scale, and the impact of the development on the residential amenity of neighbouring properties would not be considered significant enough to justify a recommendation of refusal in this case. The application is therefore considered to be in accordance with policies S3, PD1, PD6 and HC10 of the adopted Derbyshire Dales Local Plan and is recommended for approval on this basis subject to planning conditions set out in section 8.0 of the report.

1.0 THE SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

- 1.1 The application property is a modern detached red brick dwelling with some cladded elements. There is a detached hipped roof garage to the west of the dwelling. The site is accessed from the east from Wyaston Road. The property is located within the southern part of Ashbourne and is located within the Ashbourne Settlement Boundary.



2.0 DETAILS OF THE APPLICATION

- 2.1 Planning permission is sought for the erection of a two storey side (west) and rear (south) extension, a single storey rear extension to replace the existing conservatory and the removal of the detached garage. The extensions will comprise of a master bedroom with an en-suite and dressing room at first floor level and an extended kitchen/ living/ dining room and craft room at ground floor level. It is proposed to face the extensions with matching brickwork (to the bottom section) and off-white render to the upper and middle sections.

3.0 PLANNING POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK

- 3.1 Adopted Derbyshire Dales Local Plan (2017)

S3 Development within Defined Settlement Boundaries
PD1 Design and Place Making
PD2 Protecting the Historic Environment
PD6 Trees, Hedgerows and Woodlands
HC10 Extensions to Dwellings

- 3.2 Ashbourne Neighbourhood Plan (2021)

Policy DES1 – Design

3.3 National Planning Policy Framework (2019)

3.4 National Planning Practice Guidance

4.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY:

T/14/00073/TPO	Works to trees subject to Tree Preservation Order TPO107	PERC	27/08/2014
0195/0004	ERECTION OF TWO HOUSES WITH GARAGES, FORMATION OF VEHICULAR ACCESS AND RE-ALIGNMENT OF WYASTON ROAD	A	16/02/1995

5.0 CONSULTATION RESPONSES

Derbyshire County Council - Highways

5.1 There are no objections to the proposed development from a traffic and highway safety point of view.

Councillor Anthony Bates

5.2 I feel that this application is a massive overdevelopment of the site and is not in keeping with the rest of the Tree's Housing Estate.

1. Over development of the site

2. Impact on neighbouring properties

3. The design is not in keeping with surrounding properties

I would also like to see this application put to the DDDC planning committee.

Councillor Robert Archer

5.3 I would like to request a site visit for Planning Committee members to understand the potential impact of this proposal on neighbouring residential amenity.

Ashbourne Town Council

5.4 Objection – Members feel this is an over-development, does not meet the economic housing needs quoting Local Plan Policies 2.31 and 2.3 and Neighbourhood Plan Policies 5.29, 5.30 and 5.31.

Derbyshire Dales District Council Trees and Landscape Officer

5.5 02/04/2024:

I recommend that the applicant should be required to submit to the Local Planning Authority, before determination of the planning application, an Arboricultural Impact Assessment report to include a Tree Protection Plan. The report should be prepared

according to the guidelines provided by BS 5837:2012 Trees in Relation to Design, Demolition and Construction to Construction – Recommendations.

I recommend that in the absence of an Arboricultural Impact Assessment and Tree Protection Plan to demonstrate otherwise, it appears that the proposals may be harmful to an established roadside tree that contributes to the character and appearance of the local landscape.

22/05/2024:

The submitted Arboricultural Impact Assessment identified that some insignificant on-site trees would need to be removed to facilitate the proposals. Also, unfortunately the most notable tree on the site – T1 a mature sycamore - should be removed regardless of the proposed development. This is for safety reasons due to colonisation by a virulent wood decay fungus resulting in increased likelihood of tree failure and unacceptable level of risk of personal harm or property damage.

The report includes appropriate recommendations for temporary tree protection measures for the retained trees and hedgerows to be used during development works. If planning consent were to be granted that I suggest that all recommendations and guidance made in the report should be required to be followed.

I suggest that tree removals to facilitate the proposed development could be replaced through planting of fruit trees in the grounds of the property.

6.0 REPRESENTATIONS RECEIVED

6.1 16 Letters of representation have been received from neighbouring residents in respect of the proposals. A summary of the concerns pertaining to material planning considerations are detailed below:

- The scale of the development
- Loss of light
- Overshadowing/ overbearing presence near common boundary
- Highway safety concerns
- Insufficient parking space
- Development not in keeping with its surroundings
- Height of the development
- Surface water drainage issues
- Contrary to Local Plan Policies.

Further comments submitted following the receipt of amended plans include:

- Impact of the two-storey extension – Overbearing, loss of light and loss of privacy
- Impact on biodiversity.

7.0 OFFICER APPRAISAL

Principle

- 7.1 The site is located within the Ashbourne Settlement Boundary where policies permit extensions and alterations to existing dwellings provided that they are in-keeping with the character and appearance of the host dwelling and conserve the significance of the Conservation Area in accordance with policies PD1 and S3. Regard should also be given to Policy HC10 (Extensions to Dwellings) which requires extensions/ enlargements to have a height, scale, form and design that is in keeping with the scale and character of the original dwelling and the site's wider setting and location.

Impact on the character and appearance of the building and the wider area

- 7.2 Policy PD1 requires all development to be of a high quality that respects the character, identity and context of the townscape and that contributes positively to an area's character in terms of scale, height, density, layout, appearance, materials and relationship to adjacent buildings. Policy HC10 supports extensions to residential properties provided that the plot size is large enough to accommodate the extension without resulting in an overdeveloped site and that the scale, height, form and design of the extension is in keeping with the scale and character of the original dwelling and the site's wider setting and location.
- 7.3 It is proposed to extend the dwelling through the erection of a two-storey (west) side and rear extension and a separate single storey rear extension. This is an amended proposal following concerns being raised with the original scheme. The original scheme proposed extensions to the dwelling in the form of a two storey (west) side extension which also projected forward of the front elevation and adjoined a repositioned replacement garage and a single storey front extension. Following ongoing discussions with the agent, the current revised scheme was submitted, re-configuring the extensions, removing the garage element and reducing the mass of the extensions towards the north and west boundaries of the site.
- 7.4 The two-storey extension is to have hipped roofs, corresponding to the original dwelling. With both the side section and rear sections of the extension having ridge heights lower than the original dwelling (approx. 300mm). The side extension has also been set back between 400mm and 1metre from the front of the original dwelling helping it to appear more subservient.
- 7.5 In terms of materials, it is proposed to face the extensions with matching brick and off-white render, with the extensions predominantly being rendered. It is noted that the surrounding properties are mainly faced with brick, however there are examples of partially render properties within the locality. It is therefore not considered that the use of render would appear alien or appear out of context in this instance.
- 7.6 It is considered that the revised proposals are of a scale and presence that they would not appear out of context or overwhelming to the host dwelling or to be considered harmful to the character and appearance of the wider street scene.

Impact on the amenity of neighbouring properties

- 7.6 The property sits to the western side of Wyaston Road and faces a property (2A Wyaston Road) which is of a similar appearance and layout. There are 3 detached properties to its western boundary 10, 12 and 14 Duncombe Drive. With 12 Duncombe Drive being in the closest proximity to the application property and proposed development. To the south of the site there is a grassed area of land with a footpath leading from Wyaston Road to Duncombe Drive affectively separating the application site from 4 Wyaston Road to the south.

- 7.7 The two-storey extension is to have hipped roofs, corresponding to the original dwelling. With both the side section and rear sections of the extension having ridge heights lower than the original dwelling (approx. 300mm). Due to the positioning of the extension its closest common boundary is with 12 Duncombe Drive to the west. The side extension will sit approx. 4.6m from this boundary. Limited windows and doors have been included within the west facing elevation with a door and window at ground floor level and a roof light. Given the positioning of these elements it is not considered that the extension will result in any significant loss of privacy to the occupiers of 12 Duncombe Drive.
- 7.8 As the side/ rear extension is two storey it is acknowledged that the development will result of overshadowing/ loss of light to the rear part of the rear garden of 12 Duncombe Drive. However due to the distance between the property boundary and the proposed development, it is not considered, on balance, that the development would result in a loss of light to the wider garden area of 12 Duncombe Drive and therefore would not be considered significant enough to justify a recommendation of refusal in this case.

Impact on trees

- 7.9 It is noted that there are number of trees on and adjacent to the application site. A number of these trees are also subject to a Tree Preservation Order (DDDC TPO 107). During the consideration of the application an Arboriculture Impact Assessment was submitted which identified that some less significant on-site trees were to be removed to facilitate the proposals. It also noted that a mature Sycamore tree should also be removed, regardless of the proposals, for safety reasons.
- 7.10 The Assessment also includes a number of recommendations for temporary tree protection measures for the retained trees and hedgerows to be used during development works. it is concluded that the proposal, subject to the recommendations and guidance set out in the report is in accordance with Policy PD6 of the Local Plan (2017).

Conclusion

- 7.11 The proposed development, as amended, is considered on balance to be acceptable in terms of design and scale, and the impact of the development on the residential amenity of neighbouring properties would not be considered significant enough to justify a recommendation of refusal in this case. The application is therefore considered to be in accordance with policies S3, PD1, PD6 and HC10 of the adopted Derbyshire Dales Local Plan and is recommended for approval on this basis.

8.0 RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be permitted subject to the following conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted must be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this permission.

Reason: This is a statutory period which is specified in Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2. The development hereby approved shall not be carried out other than in accordance with the following approved plans, except insofar as may otherwise be required by other conditions to which this planning permission is subject:

01 - Site Location Plan, Drawing No. J3703-01 (received 09.01.2024)

02 - Existing and Proposed Site Layout Plans, Drawing No. J3703-01 Rev. C
(received 21.03.2024)

03 - Proposed Ground Floor Plan, Drawing No. J3703-05 Rev. B
(received 21.03.2024)

04 - Proposed Ground Floor Plan and Elevations, Drawing No. J3703-06 Rev. B
(received 21.03.2024)

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure the satisfactory external appearance of the development.

3. Prior to any site clearance, groundworks, excavations, demolition or construction works and before any materials or plant are brought onto the site for the purpose of the development, temporary tree protection fencing shall be erected on site in accordance with the recommendations and Tree Protection Plan set out in the submitted Arboricultural Impact Assessment (dated 01.05.2024 and prepared by Apex Environmental Ltd). The fencing must remain throughout the period of construction and no materials or equipment shall be stored, no rubbish dumped, no fires lit or any excavations or changes in land level made within the fenced area.

Reason: To protect trees during the development phase in the interests of the safety, stability and health of the trees and to ensure continuity of their contribution to visual amenity, wildlife and biodiversity benefits, human health and social benefits and climate minimisation in accordance with Policy PD6 of the Adopted Derbyshire Dales Local Plan (2017).

9.0 NOTES TO APPLICANT:

1. The Local Planning Authority have during the consideration of this application engaged in a positive and proactive dialogue with the applicant's agent which resulted in the submission of a revised scheme taking into the concerns with the scale, massing and appearance of the original scheme.